TABLE V-3. ESTIMATED MORTALITY INCREASE PER 50 $\mu g/m^3$ INCREASE IN 24-h PM_{10} CONCENTRATIONS FROM U.S. STUDIES (After CD, Table 13-3)

Study Location	RR (± CI) Only PM in Model	RR (± CI) Other Pollutants in Model	Reported PM_{10} Levels Mean (Min/Max)[†]
Increased Total Acute Mortality			
Six Cities[a]		—	
Portage, WI	1.04 (0.98, 1.09)	—	18 (±11.7)
Boston, MA	1.06 (1.04, 1.09)	—	24 (±12.8)
Topeka, KS	0.98 (0.90, 1.05)	—	27 (±16.1)
St. Louis, MO	1.03 (1.00, 1.05)	—	31 (±16.2)
Kingston/Knoxville, TN	1.05 (1.00, 1.09)	—	32 (±14.5)
Steubenville, OH	1.05 (1.00, 1.08)	—	46 (±32.3)
St. Louis, MO[c]	1.08 (1.01, 1.12)	1.06 (0.98, 1.15)	28 (1/97)
Kingston, TN[c]	1.09 (0.94, 1.25)	1.09 (0.94, 1.26	30 (4/67)
Chicago, IL[h]	1.04 (1.00, 1.08)	—	37 (4/365)
Chicago, IL[g]	1.03 (1.02, 1.04)	1.02 (1.01, 1.04)	38 (NR/128)
Utah Valley, UT[b]	1.08 (1.05, 1.11)	1.19 (0.96, 1.47)	47 (11/297)
Birmingham, AL[d]	1.05 (1.01, 1.10)	—	48 (21, 80)
Los Angeles, CA[f]	1.03 (1.00, 1.055)	1.02 (0.99, 1.036)	58(15/177)

References:

[a]Schwartz et al. (1996a).
[b]Pope et al. (1992, 1994)/O_3.
[c]Dockery et al. (1992)/O_3.
[d]Schwartz (1993).
[g]Ito and Thurston (1996)/O_3.
[f]Kinney et al. (1995)/O_3, CO.
[h]Styer et al. (1995).

[†]Min/Max 24-h PM_{10} in parentheses unless noted otherwise as standard deviation (± S.D), 10 and 90 percentile (10, 90). NR = not reported.
[*]Means of several cities.

TABLE 13-4. EFFECT ESTIMATES PER VARIABLE INCREMENTS IN 24-h CONCENTRATIONS OF FINE PARTICLE INDICATORS ($PM_{2.5}$, $SO_4^=$, H^+) FROM U.S. AND CANADIAN STUDIES

Acute Mortality	Indicator	RR (± CI) per 25 $\mu g/m^3$ PM Increase	Reported PM Levels Mean (Min/Max)[†]
Six City[A]			
Portage, WI	$PM_{2.5}$	1.030 (0.993, 1.071)	11.2 (±7.8)
Topeka, KS	$PM_{2.5}$	1.020 (0.951, 1.092)	12.2 (±7.4)
Boston, MA	$PM_{2.5}$	1.056 (1.038, 1.0711)	15.7 (±9.2)
St. Louis, MO	$PM_{2.5}$	1.028 (1.010, 1.043)	18.7 (±10.5)
Kingston/Knoxville, TN	$PM_{2.5}$	1.035 (1.005, 1.066)	20.8 (±9.6)
Steubenville, OH	$PM_{2.5}$	1.025 (0.998, 1.053)	29.6 (±21.9)
Increased Hospitalization			
Ontario, CAN[B]	$SO_4^=$	1.03 (1.02, 1.04)	R = 3.1-8.2
Ontario, CAN[C]	$SO_4^=$	1.03 (1.02, 1.04)	R = 2.0-7.7
	O_3	1.03 (1.02, 1.05)	
NYC/Buffalo, NY[D]	$SO_4^=$	1.05 (1.01, 1.10)	NR
Toronto[D]	H^+ (Nmol/m^3)	1.16 (1.03, 1.30)[*]	28.8 (NR/391)
	$SO_4^=$	1.12 (1.00, 1.24)	7.6 (NR, 48.7)
	$PM_{2.5}$	1.15 (1.02, 1.78)	18.6 (NR, 66.0)
Increased Respiratory Symptoms			
Southern California[F]	$SO_4^=$	1.48 (1.14, 1.91)	R = 2-37
Six Cities[G] (Cough)	$PM_{2.5}$	1.19 (1.01, 1.42)[**]	18.0 (7.2, 37)[***]
	$PM_{2.5}$ Sulfur	1.23 (0.95, 1.59)[**]	2.5 (3.1, 61)[***]
	H^+	1.06 (0.87, 1.29)[**]	18.1 (0.8, 5.9)[***]
Six Cities[G] (Lower Resp. Symp.)	$PM_{2.5}$	1.44 (1.15-1.82)[**]	18.0 (7.2, 37)[***]
	$PM_{2.5}$ Sulfur	1.82 (1.28-2.59)[**]	2.5 (0.8, 5.9)[***]
	H^+	1.05 (0.25-1.30)[**]	18.1 (3.1, 61)[***]
Decreased Lung Function			
Uniontown, PA[E]	$PM_{2.5}$	PEFR 23.1 (-0.3, 36.9) (per 25 $\mu g/m^3$)	25/88 (NR/88)

References:
[A]Schwartz et al. (1996a)
[B]Burnett et al. (1994)
[C]Burnett et al. (1995) O_3
[D]Thurston et al. (1992, 1994)
[E]Neas et al. (1995)
[F]Ostro et al. (1993)
[G]Schwartz et al. (1994)

[†]Min/Max 24-h PM indicator level shown in parentheses unless otherwise noted as (± S.D.), 10 and 90 percentile (10,90) or R = range of values from min-max, no mean value reported.
[*]Change per 100 nmoles/m^3
[**]Change per 20 $\mu g/m^3$ for $PM_{2.5}$; per 5 $\mu g/m^3$ for $PM_{2.5}$ sulfur; per 25 nmoles/m^3 for H^+.
[***]50th percentile value (10,90 percentile)

TABLE 13-5. EFFECT ESTIMATES PER INCREMENTS[a] IN ANNUAL MEAN LEVELS OF FINE PARTICLE INDICATORS FROM U.S. AND CANADIAN STUDIES

Type of Health Effect & Location	Indicator	Change in Health Indicator per Increment in PM[a]	Range of City PM Levels Means ($\mu g/m^3$)
Increased total chronic mortality in adults		Relative Risk (95% CI)	
Six City[b]	$PM_{15/10}$	1.42 (1.16-2.01)	18-47
	$PM_{2.5}$	1.31 (1.11-1.68)	11-30
	$SO_4^=$	1.46 (1.16-2.16)	5-13
ACS Study[c] (151 U.S. SMSA)	$PM_{2.5}$	1.17 (1.09-1.26)	9-34
	$SO_4^=$	1.10 (1.06-1.16)	4-24
Increased bronchitis in children		Odds Ratio (95% CI)	
Six City[d]	$PM_{15/10}$	3.26 (1.13, 10.28)	20-59
Six City[e]	TSP	2.80 (1.17, 7.03)	39-114
24 City[f]	H^+	2.65 (1.22, 5.74)	6.2-41.0
24 City[f]	$SO_4^=$	3.02 (1.28, 7.03)	18.1-67.3
24 City[f]	$PM_{2.1}$	1.97 (0.85, 4.51)	9.1-17.3
24 City[f]	PM_{10}	3.29 (0.81, 13.62)	22.0-28.6
Southern California[g]	$SO_4^=$	1.39 (0.99, 1.92)	—
Decreased lung function in children			
Six City[d,h]	$PM_{15/10}$	NS Changes	20-59
Six City[e]	TSP	NS Changes	39-114
24 City[i,j]	H^+ (52 nmoles/m^3)	−3.45% (-4.87, -2.01) FVC	—
24 City[i]	$PM_{2.1}$ (15 $\mu g/m^3$)	−3.21% (-4.98, -1.41) FVC	—
24 City[i]	$SO_4^=$ (7 $\mu g/m^3$)	−3.06% (-4.50, -1.60) FVC	—
24 City[i]	PM_{10} (17 $\mu g/m^3$)	−2.42% (-4.30, -.0.51) FVC	—

[a]Estimates calculated annual-average PM increments assume: a 100 $\mu g/m^3$ increase for TSP; a 50 $\mu g/m^3$ increase for PM_{10} and PM_{15}; a 25 $\mu g/m^3$ increase for $PM_{2.5}$; and a 15 $\mu g/m^3$ increase for $SO_4^=$, except where noted otherwise; a 100 nmole/m^3 increase for H^+.
[b]Dockery et al. (1993)
[c]Pope et al. (1995)
[d]Dockery et al. (1989)
[e]Ware et al. (1986)
[f]Dockery et al. (1996)
[g]Abbey et al. (1995a,b,c)
[h]NS Changes = No significant changes.
[i]Raizenne et al. (1996)
[j]Pollutant data same as for Dockery et al. (1996)